

# The Information Content of Corporate Websites Bradford Lynch-Levy and Daniel Taylor NBER Big Data, December 10, 2021

- Securities and Exchange Commission (Release 33-8128, 2002)

## "

[A]n efficient and economical method for companies to make information available about themselves to many investors is through their Internet websites.



#### Motivation

- The disclosure literature is vast
- The information effects of SEC filings, management forecasts, analyst reports, and press releases are well documented
- A survey of the literature reveals that comparatively little is known about how firms and shareholders use corporate websites



## Background - Regulation

- In 1995, the SEC highlighted the growing prevalence of the PC in households and the low cost of electronic communication\*
- In 2000, the SEC recommends all firms use websites for investor relations\*\*
- ▶ In 2002, the SEC asks all firms to
  - 1. Disclose their web address in their annual report
  - 2. Firms without a website must explain why they do not have one\*\*\*
- As of August 7, 2008, the SEC allows companies to <u>substitute</u> website disclosures for 8-K filings on EDGAR<sup>\*\*\*\*</sup>

\*SEC Release 33-7233, \*\*SEC Release 33-7856, \*\*\*SEC Release 33-8128, \*\*\*\*SEC Release 34-58288

### Background - Adoption of websites



Dow's website circa 1996, archived by Alexa Internet.



### Background - Adoption of websites



Dow's website circa 1996, archived by Alexa Internet.



### But are websites more than EDGAR?

"This code of ethics and the Company's corporate governance policies are posted on the Company's website at <u>http://www.JohnDeere.com</u>." (Deere & Co 2003 10-K)





"We make our website content available for information purposes only. It should not be relied upon for investment purposes, nor is it incorporated by reference into this Form 10-K." (Telos 10-K, 2003)

"In addition, the Company has posted the **charters** for its **Audit Committee**, **Compensation Committee**, and **Nominating and Corporate Governance Committee**, as well as the ... on its website." (Ansys's 2018 10-K)



\*Emphasis added



#### But are websites more than EDGAR? - Kiora

Kiora (Formerly EyeGate) never posts their earnings announcements to EDGAR. Instead, they keep records of the PRs on their website



ABOUT TECHNOLOGY ✔ PIPELINE INVESTORS ✔ NEWS

#### Kiora Pharmaceuticals Reports Third Quarter 2021 Financial

#### **Results and Provides Business Update**

SALT LAKE CITY, UT, Nov 15, 2021 – Kiora Pharmaceuticals, Inc. (NASDAQ: KPRX), ("Kiora financial results for the quarter ended September 30, 2021 and provided an update on rec

"We recently sharpened the focus of our pipeline strategy, which now includes developmen disease with a potentially expedited and cost-efficient path to market," said Brian M. Strem Officer of Kiora. "We anticipate multiple upcoming milestones, including advancing KIO-3( topline data from our exploratory dry eye study of KIO-101 and finalizing the design of our 2022."

Recently, Kiora has achieved several milestones, including the following:

Pipeline Updates

- Acquired Bayon Therapeutics, Inc. in October, which brought in a portfolio of small m 301, which is designed to restore vision in patients with inherited and age-related de
- Completed enrollment in a Phase 1/2a proof-of-concept study in September to evalu surface inflammation.

Corporate Updates

- Appointed Eric J. Daniels, M.D. as Chief Development Officer in October to drive the portfolio of clinical-stage assets, expanding pipeline, and proprietary platform.
- Raised gross proceeds of \$10.75 million through a registered direct offering in Augus position.
- Appointed Brian M. Strem, Ph.D. as CEO in July bringing to the Company strategic and scientific expertise in ophthalmology.

8-K

8-K

Documents

Documents



Current report, items 1.01, 2.01, 3.02, 5.02, 7.01, and 9.01

Acc-no: 0001104659-21-129738 (34 Act) Size: 677 KB

Acc-no: 0001104659-21-115504 (34 Act) Size: 7 MB

Current report, items 7.01 and 9.01

001-36672

211345899

001-36672

211252608

2021-10-26

2021-09-14

But are websites more than EDGAR? - Ansys

10+ presentations containing hundreds of slides by top management were posted to Ansys's website and not mentioned elsewhere



9

#### **Research** Questions

Do firms use their corporate website to provide pertinent new information to investors?

> If so, what are the broad topics of that information?



#### Contribution

- 1. Investor relations
  - Corporate website disclosure is economically significant
  - Websites contain *more* business operations content than EDGAR
- 2. Information processing costs
  - Websites alleviate information asymmetry between investors
- 3. Effects of new technologies on markets
  - Websites are largely unregulated but have significant capital market effects

These results hold across a variety of research designs, identification strategies, and cross-sectional tests



#### Related Literature on Corporate Websites

- Boulland et al. (working paper) construct a quarterly measure of website content using data from the Internet Archive (IA)
  - Find it is positively correlated with the provision of earnings forecasts, EDGAR filings, and EDGAR file size
- The IA, or Wayback Machine, scrapes webpages and makes historical archives available to the public
- Caution: IA endogenously chooses which pages to scrape and when to scrape them based on internet attention
  - ➢ IA data poses key identification challenges





Saved 214 times between July 24, 2014 and November 27, 2021.



#### Note

This calendar view maps the number of times **celcuity.com** was crawled by the Wayback Machine, *not* how many times the site was actually updated. More info in the FAQ.



Related Literature – Celcuity Inc.

Saved 214 times between July 24, 2014 and November 27, 2021.



#### Note

This calendar view maps the number of times **celcuity.com** was crawled by the Wayback Machine, *not* how many times the site was actually updated. More info in the FAQ.



Related Literature – Celcuity Inc.

**∞**Wharton

Saved 214 times between July 24, 2014 and November 27, 2021.





Note This calendar view maps t site was actually updated. Bubble size represents count of scrapes that day

ot how many times the

15

### Sample Selection

- We collect daily observations of *all* corporate websites listed in Compustat *everyday* at 9:15AM from July through October, 2019
  - Minimal selection bias
  - Includes the homepage and all inner pages
- Sample is ~150 Terabytes
- We collect data on control variables from Compustat, CRSP, RavenPack, SEC EDGAR, and NYSE TAQ
- > 220,505 firm-date observations

#### Measuring Website Content

➢ In principle, there are numerous ways to measure content

Text, images, videos, tables, external data referenced via hyperlinks



#### Measuring Website Content

➢ In principle, there are numerous ways to measure content

- > Text, images, videos, tables, external data referenced via hyperlinks
- We measure the length of the document, the number of HTML formatting tags, links, rich content, and dynamic elements

Variable	N-obs	Mean	Std	Median
Length	220,505	2791.14	4335.93	1773
Formatting	220,505	372.84	381.47	281
Links	220,505	123.59	144.95	89
Rich	220,505	32.92	71.84	16
Dynamic	220,505	20.44	18.72	16



#### Measuring Website Content (Cont'd)

- We construct a composite measure, *WebContent*, using factor analysis
- The first principal factor explains 92% of the variation in our five proxies for content, loads positively on all measures, and is the only factor with an eigenvalue greater than unity

Factor	Eigenvalue	Proportion of	Cumulative proportion	First Factor Loading	
		the variation	of the variation	Variable	Weight
		explained	explained		
1 <sup>st</sup>	2.28	92.4%	92.4%	Length	0.527
$2^{nd}$	0.16	6.6%	99.0%	Formatting	0.948
3 <sup>rd</sup>	0.03	1.0%	100.0%	Links	0.845
				Rich	0.471
				Dynamic	0.833



### Daily Event Study

- Focus on "events" where the change in *WebContent* is in the top tercile and there are no EDGAR filings or PRs in the [-1,+1] window around the change
- Examine changes in capital market outcomes in a tight window around the event
- Daily nature of the data allows for firm-quarter fixed effects
  - Tight event study design to test whether websites contain information content incremental to SEC filings and PRs



Results

$$Outcome_{i,t+1} = \alpha + \gamma \cdot Controls_{i,t} + \varepsilon_{i,t}$$

$$Plot_{t} = \frac{E[\varepsilon_{t}] - E[\varepsilon]}{Var(\varepsilon)}$$

Absolute Returns







Results

$$Outcome_{i,t+1} = \alpha + \gamma \cdot Controls_{i,t} + \varepsilon_{i,t}$$

$$Plot_{t} = \frac{E[\varepsilon_{t}] - E[\varepsilon]}{Var(\varepsilon)}$$









#### Dissemination Versus New Information

- It is possible that corporate websites merely serve as a dissemination tool rather than providing new information
- To distinguish between the two roles, we re-estimate our previous models while varying the width of the non-disclosure window
  - Require that there are no SEC filings or PRs in the [-s,+s] window around the change in website content



23

#### Dissemination Versus New Information

	Dep. Var. AbsoluteReturn		Dep. Var. Volume		
Non-disclosure Window [-s,+s]	Coeff. on EventDay[0,10]	<i>t</i> -stat on <i>EventDay</i> [0,10]	Coeff. on EventDay[0,10]	<i>t</i> -stat on <i>EventDay</i> [0,10]	
Excluding observations with disclosures $[-5,+5]$ <i>N-obs</i> = 444,446, <i>N-events</i> = 7,214	0.60***	(5.82)	0.55***	(6.51)	
Excluding observations with disclosures $[-10,+10]$ <i>N-obs</i> = 307,112, <i>N-events</i> = 4,987	0.63**	(5.00)	0.43***	(4.69)	
Excluding observations with disclosures $[-15,+15]$ <i>N-obs</i> = 228,548, <i>N-events</i> = 3,712	0.53***	(3.44)	0.30***	(2.97)	
Controls	Yes		Yes		
Date FE	Yes		Yes		
Firm-Year-Qtr FE	Yes		Yes		

Types of Content in Corporate Websites

- We classify changes in WebContent according to file type, e.g., Office documents, PDFs, and engineering drawings are Productivity related
- Productivity related files make up roughly 10% of the content in WebContent changes





Types of Content in Corporate Websites

We classify changes in *WebContent* using the topic model of Dyer et al. (2017) and compare to EDGAR





#### Conclusions

- Using a tight event study design, we find that websites contain information content incremental to traditionally studied channels
- Notably, the market reaction to website changes is of similar economic significance as SEC filings and press releases
- Additionally, websites contain *more* business operations content than EDGAR and the market reaction to such information is heightened

